

UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE INTERNATIONAL EXAMINATIONS
GCE Advanced Subsidiary and Advanced Level

MARK SCHEME for the June 2005 question paper

9697 HISTORY

**9697/06 Paper 6 (Caribbean History, 1794 - 1900),
maximum raw mark 100**

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were initially instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began. Any substantial changes to the mark scheme that arose from these discussions will be recorded in the published *Report on the Examination*.

All Examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes must be read in conjunction with the question papers and the *Report on the Examination*.

- CIE will not enter into discussion or correspondence in connection with these mark schemes.

CIE is publishing the mark schemes for the June 2005 question papers for most IGCSE and GCE Advanced Level and Advanced Subsidiary Level syllabuses and some Ordinary Level syllabuses.



Grade thresholds for Syllabus 9697 (History) in the June 2005 examination.

	maximum mark available	minimum mark required for grade:		
		A	B	E
Component 6	100	72	66	43

The thresholds (minimum marks) for Grades C and D are normally set by dividing the mark range between the B and the E thresholds into three. For example, if the difference between the B and the E threshold is 24 marks, the C threshold is set 8 marks below the B threshold and the D threshold is set another 8 marks down. If dividing the interval by three results in a fraction of a mark, then the threshold is normally rounded down.



June 2005

GCE AS/A LEVEL

MARK SCHEME

MAXIMUM MARK: 100

SYLLABUS/COMPONENT: 9697/06

HISTORY

Paper 6

Caribbean History, 1974 - 1900



Page 1	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

Section A: Source Based Question

From the syllabus: This will present candidates with an assertion which they need to test against given sources and their background knowledge of the issue. Candidates will be expected to have an understanding of the ways in which sources may be evaluated.

1 ‘As the nineteenth century progressed it became clear that there was no future for the Caribbean sugar industry.’ How far does the evidence of Sources A-E support this statement?

L 1 WRITES ABOUT THE HYPOTHESIS, NO SOURCE USE [1-5]

Merely writing about issues covered by the source is not source use. Use of sources involves identification of sources by letter or by direct quote in order to test the hypothesis.

Answers will be about the topic but ignore the demands of the question by not using the sources as information or evidence to test the hypothesis. Include, in this level, answers which use information taken from the sources, but only in producing a general account, without direct references to the sources.

(Levels 2 and 3: Sources used to provide information.)

L 2 USES INFORMATION TAKEN FROM THE SOURCES TO CHALLENGE OR SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS. [6-8]

Sources are used for information rather than as evidence i.e. sources are used at face value with no evaluation/interpretation of content e.g. using Sources A, B and C, to challenge or C and D to support the hypothesis.

L 3 USES INFORMATION TAKEN FROM THE SOURCES TO CHALLENGE AND SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [9-13]

These answers show that testing a hypothesis involves both attempting to confirm and to disconfirm it. However, sources are still only used at face value e.g. challenge comes from A, B and E. C and D give support.

L 4 BY INTERPRETING/EVALUATING SOURCES IN CONTEXT, FIND EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE OR SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS [14-16]

The answers will show a capacity to use sources as evidence e.g. demonstrating their utility in testing the hypothesis by interpreting them in their historical context i.e. not simply accepting them at face value. Source A suggests a healthy picture, but does not state clearly that there will be all round prosperity; B may be exaggerating; C may be tested against the candidates' own knowledge; D sets out a general situation from a British perspective; E opens up the discussion of the assertion about no future etc.

Candidates may use the provenance of the sources as a tool to test the validity of sources at this level and above e.g. dates, with explanations, pick up nuances from the writers' positions. Contextual material and careful attention to content important.

Page 2	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

- L 5 BY INTERPRETING/EVALUATING SOURCES IN CONTEXT, FINDS EVIDENCE TO CHALLENGE AND SUPPORT THE HYPOTHESIS. [17-21]

These answers demonstrate an understanding that testing the hypothesis involves both attempting to confirm and disconfirm the hypothesis, and are capable of using sources to do this (both confirmation and opposition are done at this level). Candidates could link A and B (appear to corroborate each other), while D and E present contrasts based on differing circumstances. C is illustrative of a general trend.

- L 6 AS LEVEL 5 **And** [22-25]

- (a) explains why evidence to challenge or to support is better/preferred (i.e. a comparative judgement on why some evidence is better and other evidence is worse).
- (b) **Or** reconciles/explains problems in the evidence to show that neither challenge nor support is to be preferred.

e.g.

- (a) A candidate may separate Source E from the rest and then argue that A and B have been superseded by D as a result of the passage of time (and/or invoking own knowledge). Source C may back D (problems/wider Caribbean example). Cuba in E was a special case (soils, organisation, mechanisation, US market and capital) and so D is more representative.
- (b) The sources differ in time and geographical locations. Support for the assertion in D does not cancel out E, which shows there is no overall pattern. A, B and C all suggest problems but elements of optimism.

N.B. IN LEVELS 2-5 THE MARKS WILL REFLECT THE NUMBER OF SOURCES USED.

ATTEMPTS AT EVALUATION WHICH RELY ON COMMENTS ABOUT SOURCE TYPE, AND MAKE NO USE OF SOURCE CONTENT, WILL NOT ACHIEVE LEVELS 4-6.

[Mark out of 25]

Section B: Essay Questions

Refer to general notes defining levels

- 2 **Discuss the factors which account for the abolition of slavery in British, French and Spanish colonies in the Caribbean.**

Candidates should concentrate on how emancipation was brought about: reward efforts to compare the respective roles of humanitarian activity, resistance of the enslaved, political and economic factors.

British 1833-4

- decline in economic position of sugar production e.g. high cost, low profit.
- 1830-33 high level of anti-slavery activity: moral and economic.
- issue of slave resistance, 1831 Jamaica rebellion: revived fears of Haiti-like action.
- change of government: Whigs in power: impact of 1832 Reform.

Page 3	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

French 1848

- combination of the politics of anti-slavery and the economics of free trade.
- after British emancipation, French government under pressure from abolitionist movement 1830s and 1840s.
- government could not decide on the question of 'How to abolish?' e.g. public opinion against apprenticeship scheme, 1840s attempts at amelioration.
- economic events affected French West Indian sugar industry - sugar beet in France.
- 1848 political change (2nd Republic): Victor Schoelcher and other abolitionists provided consciousness within the country to make it possible.

Spanish colonies, especially Cuba, 1868-86

- the interplay of civil war, slave rebellion and industrial technology combined to destabilise slavery as a social and economic institution. International pressures played a part.
- following an unsuccessful revolution in Puerto Rico to gain independence and free slaves, officials in 1873 moved to free slaves.
- Ten Year War in Cuba 1868-78 weakened slave owners and Spanish government (some slaves freed: slaves fought on both sides). Treaty of Zanjón 1878, government agreed to free slaves.
- Moret Law 1870 had already freed those born after 1868 and those over 60.
- those slaves who had fought in war freed 1878: 1879 slaves in Eastern provinces of Cuba rebelled: 1880 emancipation legislation.
- Spanish government had in 1879 come under pressure from domestic abolitionists, from rebels in Cuba, from slaves in the East who refused to work.
- slavery weakened by growing importance of other labour systems, Chinese indentured labour, free white wage earners. Comparison led to the discovery that free labour was more reliable and productive.

N.B. Some candidates may interpret 'abolition of slavery' as the end of apprenticeship or patronato. Allow this when deciding which mark to award within a band.

[Mark out of 25]

Page 4	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

3 Compare apprenticeship in the British Caribbean with the patronato in Cuba and assess their respective results.

General point: 'apprenticeship' was a system which was neither slavery nor freedom.

Areas of comparison/differences could include:

- general comparison of the terms of emancipation legislation.
- the working of the systems.
- the premature conclusions of both.
- impact on economies and workforce.
- society and role of former slaves.

Apprenticeship in British Caribbean

- complex legislation on length of apprenticeship, purchase of freedom, supervision of magistrates etc.
- over time flaws in system apparent: early ending 1838.
- seen as a further blow to sugar economy after end of slave trade: various areas had labour problems etc.
- freed people able to exercise choices: still stratified society: political rights.

Patronato in Cuba

- complex legislation: ex-slaves became patrocinos: obliged to work for former owners: patrocinos to receive pay (1-3 pesos monthly) and able to purchase freedom (amounts laid down): masters kept substantial authority - control of hours, movement, conditions and corporal punishment (only to 1883): patrocinos could charge masters with violation of conditions, if proved they were freed: from 1885 one quarter of the remaining patrocinos to be freed each year until system ended in 1888.
- no immediate changes in 1880: old system of holidays and rewards remained, possibly to encourage productivity.
- by 1882-3 changes taking place: steady stream of patrocinos purchasing freedom: some freed by bringing charges against masters: masters tried to keep patrocinos on estates - provisions from company stores. Number of patrocinos fell - about 100,000 in 1883 (half of slave number 1877).
- patronato was said to be the worst of both worlds for masters with neither the stimulus of corporal punishment nor the fear of dismissal to control patrocinos.
- 1885 gradual freeing of patrocinos by age began: patronato already in a state of decay: 1884 sugar prices dropped: may have encouraged abandonment of slavery.
- October 1886 by royal decree following a parliamentary resolution, patronato was abolished.

Page 5	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

- mechanisms in the emancipation law emerged as significant for the actual process of emancipation.

[Mark out of 25]

4 Assess the reasons why freed people left the estates where they had been slaves.

There were varieties of reasons - over time and area. There is little in terms of statements from ex-slaves. Emancipation widened their expectations.

Some suggested reasons:

- ex-slaves wished to remove themselves from the estates on which they had suffered in the days of bondage (flight from the estates). Comment on British West Indies, the movement of ex-slaves from estates in the immediate post emancipation years was not a flight from the horrors of slavery. It was a protest against the inequalities of early 'freedom'.
- the desire that some freed people had to establish secure access to land ownership: desire for personal liberty and land of their own. Comment, this would depend on availability of land.
- ex-slaves were forced to leave estates because of the harsh attitudes and demands of masters: background of coercive tactics and dislike of insecure jobs on plantations. Comment (Eisner) 'had they been assured of attractive wages and conditions of employment there is no reason to suppose that they would not have remained on the estates.'
- revolt against plantation system and colonialism: masters' policies seemed to be a betrayal of the principles of emancipation. Comment (of Guyana) 'the rise of the village settlement was symbolic of the continuation of the revolt against the plantation system by free labour, reinforced after 1838 by the advantages denied under slavery.'
- N.B. ex-slaves did not entirely withdraw their labour but they did not offer their services regularly.

The movement stretched over time

- British West Indies, 1838-60 rapid acquisition of land holdings and increase in the number of peasants.
- peasantry was widespread across the Caribbean.

Examples

- British Caribbean provides wide range of situations.
- French colonies: by 1853 claim that 20% of sugar workers in Martinique and Guadeloupe had left estates: French Guyana freed people immediately turned their backs on estate labour, there was plenty of land to occupy and farm.
- complaints of labour shortages in Suriname: moves to town etc.
- in Cuba, after patronato, many remained and hired themselves out as wage labourers: landholders complained about shortage of full-time female labour.

[Mark out of 25]

Page 6	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

5 To what extent were societies and economies of Caribbean colonies affected by emancipation up to 1900? Explain your answer.

Candidates will probably concentrate on the activities and actions of freed people in creating peasantries, diversifying the economy and helping to change social and cultural aspects. They may (should) consider the impact of immigration.

Economy of British Caribbean

- creation of a peasantry with social and economic aspects.
- impact of peasantry on plantation labour supply: need for new sources (through immigration) to 'save sugar industry'. (Immigration on its own would not solve all problems.)
- peasantry helped to reduce dependence on imported food: grew provision crops, sold on local markets or to middle men etc.
- participation of peasants in export trades and diversification: contributed to money earned in the region (Jamaica small farmers contributed 10% to value of exports in 1850: 39% in 1890).
- peasantry benefited by finding alternative to full time plantation labour.

Social and Cultural impacts

- peasants formed villages and markets, social as well as economic centres: schools and churches in villages: African culture kept alive: local co-operatives formed.
- friendly and benefit societies, agricultural and co-operative banks formed.
- little formal political participation: some qualified to vote.
- development of black middle class linked with rise of black landholders.
- reference could be made to social and cultural contributions of Indian immigrants.
- Black and Asian women in their economic and social roles.

Other topics which could help in assessment

- not all change the direct result of emancipation: decline of British West Indian sugar was multi-causal.
- colonial élites retain much of political and social position. Blacks, who though legally free, remained in lower social and economic positions (some change by 1900).
- education and health developed partly as a result of emancipation. Education linked with black middle class.

Page 7	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

Regional references

- Haiti: perhaps not directly linked with emancipation but results of revolution included destruction of sugar industry and development of peasantry (Pétion).
- French colonised Caribbean: growth of small proprietorship 1848-70. Cane sugar grown on plots, provision growing and cattle rearing: sold at local markets and in towns.
- Dutch Caribbean (largely Suriname): planters deserted estates: some taken over by freed blacks - to grow food: labour shortage: estates dropped from 400 to 100 by 1900.

[Mark out of 25]

6 How far was there a labour crisis in the Caribbean sugar industry in the second half of the nineteenth century?

The implementation of slave emancipation affected all the sugar growing areas of the Caribbean during the middle and later years of the nineteenth century. Date excludes Haiti.

Idea of 'crisis'

- landowners complained that there was a 'labour problem' - usually meant that they had lost tight control over workers' lives and did not have a reliable workforce on their properties. Workers' preference for task work etc.
- reluctance of many ex-slaves to remain at work on sugar estates as under slavery.
- the resort to seeking sources of labour through recruiting immigrants illustrated the fact that there were problems of labour on estates.
- candidates may question whether there was a general labour crisis or, if there was a crisis in the sugar industry, if it was because of the labour issue alone. Also, a crisis for whom?

Areas of 'crisis'

- Trinidad and British Guiana: sugar a late development, smaller supply of slaves when slave trade abandoned: after emancipation drop in numbers of freed people working regularly.
- Jamaica in 1860, 40,000 compared to 300,000 in 1834: even so, because of the deterioration in the sugar industry, there was a surplus of labour available. Supply exceeded demand.
- Metayage in Windwards - a temporary solution - link to planters' lack of capital.
- Spanish, some Dutch and French Caribbean, also said that the labour supply was insufficient to continue the plantation system.

Page 8	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

No 'crisis'

- Cuba had encouraged immigration (and illegal slave trade) over the period. Post emancipation no immediate crisis.
- immediately after emancipation, complaints were less marked in territories like Barbados and Antigua where land holders' control over land was effective and where alternatives were not as plentiful (picture in Barbados changing late in century - larger peasantry).
- complaints of 'labour shortage' may have been a reflection of employers' desire for an expansion of the total workforce in order to drive down the cost of labour.

[Mark out of 25]

7 How significant was discrimination based on gender in Caribbean societies after emancipation? Explain your answer.

Syllabus basis for question 'Gender issues and their practical manifestations' (e.g. patriarchal societies, notions of proper gender order).

Examples of attitudes:

- among whites, nineteenth century ideas of male dominance accepted (economic, social): ideas of morality and proper order, disapproval of those who failed to live up to them: informed much of the attitudes to women in work, society and home e.g. education for girls and 'subjects' taught.
- in some areas dominance of black males/husbands accepted (Puerto Rico - church influence).
- among Indians, subordination, women walking five paces behind husbands: situation confused by male/female ratio imbalance.
- so it can be argued that there were discriminatory views which were widely held. Momsen about twentieth century, 'Yet the traditional pattern of male dominated labour relations was not changing'.

How significant? widespread, denial of equality and personal value

- sexual exploitation e.g. of Indian females by employers, in crime - sexual assault made worse when not taken seriously by law.
- in towns: economic roles - washers, domestics, seamstresses (low pay, long hours).
- family roles among peasantry: combined field work, child care and housework.
- lesser pay e.g. for Indian women, 'some women earned nearly as much as the average man'.
- male emigration threw extra burdens on women (often doing agricultural labour).
- education often transmitted western values of gender roles - housewife, needlework.

Page 9	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

How significant? another side - but how much change?

- Blacks and Indians, male and female shared disadvantages in politics, law, society, occupation.
- Indian women often strongly individualistic - 'seeking to improve their economic position' but not considered suitable by planters.
- women as marketeers (and strong role in family finance): enhanced role accepted as not demeaning to males.
- Jamaican women after emancipation 'even when married chose and could choose economic independence and autonomy'. (Momsen).
- Patrick Bryan: professional women, by late nineteenth century, middle class occupations - shorthand, telephone, nursing - and greater literacy than males.

[Mark out of 25]

8 Explain how Haiti achieved and consolidated its independence.

Achieving independence

- no great detail needed on events pre 1799 (perhaps some by way of introduction).
- 1799-1801 assessment of significance of Toussaint's actions - Governor-General and Constitution could be used.
- quite possible to start with events from 1802: le Clerc's army: Napoleon's decree reinstituting slavery in the French Empire: black determination to resist, their leaders joining in expulsion of French: Dessaline's as leader 1803-4: declaration of independence (by which time war in Europe renewed: Napoleon abandoned his American scheme).

Consolidation of independence

- After independence there was political instability in Haiti. The sugar economy had already collapsed: efforts to revive it failed by 1820s.
- Dessalines assassinated during civil war (against Pétion) 1806.
- Haiti divided: Christophe in North: Pétion in South: fought each other 1812: on their deaths reunion under Boyer.
- Boyer ruled until 1843: captured Santo Domingo dealing with one problem/Spain: mended some international relations e.g. with France 1825 and Britain 1826: trade with US: largely internal peace and no obvious external threat.
- France could have tried to regain Haiti: after 1803 Napoleon involved in Europe: restored monarch, Louis XVIII tried to persuade Christophe and Pétion to return to French rule. They refused and maintained Haiti's independence and freedom from slavery. 1825 France recognised Haitian independence (Haiti agreed to pay indemnity).

Page 10	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	GCE A/AS LEVEL – JUNE 2005	9697	6

- 1826 Britain recognised Boyer's rule of independent Haiti.
- LaCerte on Pétion's contribution - through successive parcelisations of the plantations, Pétion had republicanised the soil. By settling the land question, he also gave Haiti nearly twenty-five years of relative peace.

In Summary

- Haiti, despite its problems, had become the first black republic, had ended slavery.
- it survived division to become reunited under Boyer, and had a period of relative peace.
- it did not fall prey to European control: France did not return: in the 1820s, despite its blood stained reputation and emancipation, its government was recognised by France and Britain.

Conversely

- its greatness as a sugar producer had gone.
- poverty and instability of government marked its history.
- BUT, in this context, these points are subordinate to those above.

[Mark out of 25]