

General Certificate of Education January 2012

Classical Civilisation 1021
Women in Athens and Rome
AS Unit 1D

Final

Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2012 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered schools and colleges for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to schools and colleges to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the schools and colleges.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the student uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of students after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Students are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the student's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	 Demonstrates accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question clear understanding of central aspects of the question ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	9-10
Level 3	 Demonstrates a range of accurate and relevant knowledge some understanding of some aspects of the question some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or • some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either • some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or • an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS				
Level 5	 • well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question • coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question • ability to sustain an argument which has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	19-20		
Level 4	 Demonstrates generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question understanding of many of the central aspects of the question ability to develop an argument which has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail and has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	14-18		
Level 3	 Demonstrates a range of accurate and relevant knowledge some understanding of some aspects of the question some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	9-13		
Level 2	 either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	5-8		
Level 1	 either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	1-4		

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS Level 5 **Demonstrates** well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question ability to sustain an argument which has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, 27-30 effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. Level 4 **Demonstrates** generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question understanding of many of the central aspects of the question ability to develop an argument which has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question. 20-26 mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. Level 3 Demonstrates a range of accurate and relevant knowledge some understanding of some aspects of the question some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question 13-19 some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. Level 2 **Demonstrates** either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate 7-12 knowledge to support them and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. Level 1 **Demonstrates** either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge **or** an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it 1-6

and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling,

punctuation and grammar.

Classical Civilisation – AQA GCE Mark Scheme 2012 January series				
This page has been left intentionally blank				

Mark Scheme Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

Section 1

Option A

01 What did Tiberius (Cornelia's husband) do to the snakes on his bed and what were his reasons?

FOUR of **e.g.** killed male [1] let female go [1] because soothsayers [1] said death of male would lead to his death [1] and of female to Cornelia's death [1] he loved wife [1] he was older [1] he wanted Cornelia to live to bring up children [1]

(4 marks)

02 What happened to both Tiberius and Gaius Gracchus (Cornelia's sons)?

elected tribune / killed violently / killed in riot / murdered [1]

(1 mark)

To what extent was Cornelia regarded as a good Roman woman? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the passages you have read about Cornelia.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- maternal qualities so highly regarded that statue erected with inscription 'Mother of the Gracchi'; sons' qualities said to have come particularly from the way Cornelia brought them up in absence of husband (said to have described them as her 'jewels'); letter survives which purports to be attempt by her to dissuade son Gaius from seeking tribunate, appealing to great Roman virtues of duty to family and state and demonstrating her rhetorical skills – whether genuine or not, shows how Cornelia remembered (or her memory manipulated) positively for transmission of Roman values to sons, whose careers were fatally controversial etc.
- also admired for fortitude in enduring husband's death and sons' murders, which she is said to have treated in a detached, patriotic way as if they were heroes of the past
- admired too for her education and culture and association with / patronage of Greek intellectuals
- praised for alleged refusal to accept Ptolemy's offer of marriage and share in his kingdom
- her pride in her father (Scipio Africanus), who had defeated Hannibal, and her living up to the family's values in ways open to women were also praised, since all the above reflected well on the family and increased its honour etc.
- only dissenting voice is Juvenal's criticism of her snobbishness an intentionally comic
 extreme view in his manic rant to dissuade recipient of satire from marrying, part of his
 satirist's persona as ordinary down-to-earth, back-to-basics Roman who claims to value
 above all simplicity of Rome's peasant origins etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

04 In the extracts you have read from Livy's History, to what extent does Livy show changes in Roman attitudes towards women in the period before Cornelia? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- Livy's purposes in writing
- the Sabine women
- Lucretia
- Cloelia
- the speeches of Cato and Valerius in the debate about the Oppian Law.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- whether re-telling legends or giving a historical narrative, Livy had a moral purpose in line with values Augustus promoting etc.
- legend of Sabine women part of foundation myth of Rome, told to show inter alia the early
 greatness of Roman manhood whose only weakness was its inability to reproduce, the
 proper female response to these male requirements including submission to deceit and
 violence if in the interests of Rome, the importance of child-rearing and obedience in
 return for respect from husbands etc.; much patronising of the women in words Livy gives
 to Romulus and other men etc.
- Lucretia part of foundation myth of Republic, treated as exemplum of ideal matrona, a
 prize-winning wife who shows unparalleled diligence, courage, duty, honour, chastity etc.,
 motivated at all times by best interests of family and Rome, who fully accepts the view
 that one's life and death should be an example to others and aware that through her
 actions she can have a political as well as moral impact; she is not merely submissive but
 takes initiative contrary to wishes of husband and father to kill herself to achieve this etc.
- Livy (with some patronising) emphasises the novelty of Cloelia's behaviour and its commemoration, her extreme bravery, intelligence and sense of duty towards Rome despite her youth and sex – qualities that were so egregious that recognised even by enemy king etc.
- debate over repeal of Oppian Law, a historical event, is set piece worked up by Livy to show with 2 representative and (in his eyes) polarised speeches conflicting views about proper behaviour of Roman women, in his own time as much as in 2nd century BC; both appeal to past to justify their views (Valerius with his list of legendary precedents is doing in miniature what Livy is doing on a grand scale); Cato, outraged, fears women's take-over and advocates return to total female subservience; Valerius positively cites occasions when women have intervened publicly for the good of Rome but these were all times of extreme crisis and patronisingly he views adornment as proper sphere for female prestige in normal circumstances rather than participation etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Option B

05 On what occasion did Turia's husband deliver this speech?

funeral / death [1]

(1 mark)

What did Turia do which showed her duty to her father and devotion to her sister and other female relatives? Give four details.

FOUR of e.g.

- showed firm resolution [1] when avenged / sought justice for / secured punishment of those responsible for parents' murder [1] before her wedding [1] when fiancé / brother-inlaw abroad [1]
- on grounds that they did not belong to same gens [1] opposed those who claimed father's will invalid [1] because of coemptio (fictitious purchase) of wife [1] which would have left sister without inheritance [1] since she was in potestas / manus (power) of husband [1] and placed Turia under their legal guardianship [1]; (if unsuccessful) Turia promised to share inheritance with sister [1] since Turia would have inherited everything [1]
- showed generosity [1] when brought up female relations (in her own houses) [1];
 prepared marriage-portions / dowries for them [1] so that could secure marriages worthy of family [1]

(4 marks)

17 In the rest of the speech, to what extent does the speaker emphasise his wife's faithfulness towards him and to what extent does he praise her other qualities? Give the reasons for your views.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- faithfulness: Turia lived with his mother after murder of parents, used her gold / jewellery to ensure he had appropriate lifestyle in exile; proposed divorce and marriage to woman of her choosing when marriage infertile etc.
- other noble qualities which Turia displays in course of demonstrating her faithfulness: ingenuity in deceiving guards when sent gold / jewellery to him in exile; courage when begged for his life and resisted Milo's attempt to plunder house; good sense when prepared hiding-place for him; endurance when repeated Octavian's / Augustus' edict to Lepidus despite his physical abuse etc.
- brief list of her domestic qualities loyalty, obedience, industry, modesty etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

To what extent does Pliny praise women for the way they performed their duties to their family and to what extent does he celebrate their individual personalities? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- Calpurnia (Pliny's wife)
- Calpurnia Hispulla (his wife's aunt)
- Minicia Marcella
- the Helvidiae sisters
- Arria
- Fannia (Arria's granddaughter).

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Calpurnia: stresses her chastity, devotion, respect, frugality; praises her discreet interest in his legal career and literary efforts; some concern over her miscarriage but relief in letter to her grandfather that shows she can conceive etc.
- Calpurnia Hispulla: praise for upbringing of Calpurnia so that she is model wife etc.
- Minicia Marcella: portrayed as having all qualities of matrona despite youth, all of which
 uses to support family interests and reflect excellence of father wisdom, modesty,
 studiousness, endurance in illness etc.
- Helvidiae: emphasis on their fertility (and its tragic consequences) etc.
- Arria: in letter to illustrate observation that actions for which one is famed are not
 necessarily one's most noble, praises not only her courage etc. in determination to die,
 setting husband example as well as providing him with consolation, but also devotion in
 caring for him when sick and her Stoicism in his interests despite death of son etc.
- Fannia: in letter expressing some personal grief, stresses her extreme devotion to husband Helvidius in opposition to emperor, care for Vestal Junia and endurance in facing illness etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Section 2

Option C

09 'In Athens, respectable women's roles were entirely private.'

To what extent does the evidence you have studied support this statement? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- the nature of the evidence
- what Ischomachus says to Socrates
- Euphiletus' speech
- the woman who allegedly had her husband poisoned
- the speech about Ciron's daughter
- the speech about Neaera and her alleged daughter Phano
- Aristophanes' Women at the Thesmophoria.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- Ischomachus explaining to Socrates how he has trained young wife to be useful in running oikos so that can enjoy leisure outside house to enhance reputation; justifies indoor role of women by reference to different characteristics god has assigned sexes; much emphasis on leader-bee analogy to stress wife's economic management role inside oikos, with some reference to production and upbringing of children to support them in old age; critical of wearing of make-up / high boots for fear of attracting external male gaze; no mention of wife leaving house, but this not necessarily satisfactory evidence to base generalisations on since the indoor focus is largely determined by Socrates' initial question and probably fictional dialogue may reflect male ideal, even among most wealthy, rather than reality etc.
- Euphiletus emphasises wife's child-bearing and domestic managerial roles gave her full responsibility for latter after demonstrated success in former; Euphiletus spends lengthy periods away from oikos, but expects wife at home; wife performs traditional female role outside oikos by attending mother-in-law's funeral, where she is spotted by Eratosthenes, who then needs help of maid who does shopping to seduce her, suggesting wife's movements outside house limited; but, in speech designed to win sympathy from jury of married men, not ridicule, says was not suspicious when wife left house in middle of night for light etc.
- poisoning trial: wife / mother alleged to have used courtesan to carry out crime, with some suggestion that this because courtesan allowed greater freedom of movement outside oikos, but of course any scheme that would have distanced wife / mother from crime would have been beneficial to her and so not good evidence for normal behaviour etc.
- Ciron's daughter: shows women clearly left oikos to perform fertility rituals of
 Thesmophoria, emphasises honour attached to presiding at them, shows how important
 to a woman's honour and so husband's, and therefore the security of his citizenship and
 inheritance, was judgement of deme members etc.
- speech about Neaera: Phano's public involvement in religion used to show how
 Stephanus' marriage of alleged alien to King Archon has supposedly endangered the
 whole city, implying communal safety depended on the proper performance of ritual,
 including that of women etc.; rhetorically tries to persuade jury to support him by
 appealing to their fear of their wives' comments if they don't, implying wives were not so
 secluded that they did not enquire about their husbands' activities and take interest in

- public world etc.; attempts to categorise women into 3 distinct kinds, all defined in relation to their personal usefulness to men, with wives distinguished by their child-rearing and household management roles, but in reality distinctions unlikely to have been so clear-cut etc.
- Women at the Thesmophoria: comic presentation of secret rituals of Thesmophoria in which norms inverted; according to Mica, Euripides' criticisms of women have all adversely affected their position inside oikos with division between male and female spheres implied by e.g. her 'We're not even allowed a free hand on our own side of the house any more', but regular joke that Euripides' mother a greengrocer, and Second Woman sells myrtle chaplets in market, so class a factor in extent to which women visible outside oikos etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Option D

10 'Athenian men's relations with their wives were dominated by fear.'

How far do you agree? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the evidence you have studied.

You might include discussion of

- the main fears Athenian husbands had
- other aspects of their relationship with their wives
- how far Athenian wives might have feared their husbands
- the nature of the evidence
- Euphiletus' speech
- the woman who allegedly had her husband poisoned
- the speech about Neaera and her alleged daughter Phano
- what Ischomachus says to Socrates
- Aristophanes' Women at the Thesmophoria.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but not necessarily all) of e.g.

- male fears: economic disaster, illegitimacy leading to problems with citizenship and inheritance; honour etc.; other concerns and women's fears, as suggested by prescribed sources etc.
- Euphiletus' speech: defence in lawcourt in which Euphiletus presumably wishes to cast himself in best possible light; had some reservations about wife when first married and watched her 'as is proper'; after birth of son, trusted her, gave her greater control in management of house, re-arranged house for her convenience and for safety of baby; his reference to laws shows serious consequences of sexual irregularity, seduction being considered worse than rape because of damage it causes to *oikos* (but not necessarily requiring death of adulterer) and matter of public concern (husband who did not divorce wife in such circumstances liable to *atimia*) etc.
- poisoning trial: speaker demonises woman with allusion to mythical archetype (Clytemnestra) which reflects male fears of female treachery and deviousness etc.
- Neaera: part of an on-going feud between Apollodorus and Stephanus; case hinges on identity of Phano, alleged by former to be daughter of prostitute Neaera, claimed by latter to be legitimate daughter by previous wife; Apollodorus covers his inability to prove his case by pointing out how quickly Phrastor divorced Phano once his suspicion was aroused because of (rather than despite) her pregnancy (but he also admits that Phrastor's desperation for an heir was so great that he recognised her son as his until

thwarted by phratry (it was said to have been his hatred of his extended family that led to his recognition of Phano's son in first place, so case probably more to do with inheritance issues within Phrastor's family, who were using Phano's alleged alien status as pretext, than cast-iron evidence to support Apollodorus – but good illustration of male fears); in any case did not deter Theogenes, until her questionable status again raised, at which point instant divorce; Apollodorus also conjures up male fears of consequences for *polis* if religious rituals improperly carried out – as well as fears of wives' criticism if they acquit Neaera etc.

- Ischomachus in probably fictional conversation with Socrates in which tone and topics
 discussed determined by Socrates' initial flattering question (how he got his reputation
 for excellence) reflects self-assured, self-satisfied confidence of successful trainer who
 can rely totally on wife to manage *oikos* and respond readily to any of his concerns (e.g.
 make-up); an idealised, utopian account, the antithesis of male fears as represented in
 myth etc.
- Aristophanes: in line with comic expectations, generally portrays women according to
 conventions of chauvinistic stereotypes (duplicitous, addicted to extravagance, drink,
 sex etc.) which reflect male fears of women's potential to destroy *oikos* etc.;
 Mnesilochus delivers series of far-fetched examples of women's deceitful and
 subversive behaviour, comically causing outrage among women, not because false but
 because Mnesilochus disclosing them; despite premise of Euripides' misogyny on which
 plot built, women in parodies of Euripides' plays (Helen, Andromeda) victims rather than
 villains etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

Section 1

Either Option A

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	4	•	4
02	1	-	1
03	5	5	10
04	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Or

Option B

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
05	1	1	1
06	4	ı	4
07	5	5	10
08	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Section 2

Either Option C

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
09	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

Or

Option D

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
10	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%